

## **Exhibit 3**

**This exhibit is a booklet and it cannot be scanned therefore only the cover and table of content has been scanned to aid you in your research. The original exhibit is on file at the Montana Historical Society and may be viewed there.**

**Montana Historical Society  
Archives, 225 N. Roberts, Helena,  
MT 59620-1201  
Phone (406) 444-4774.**

Scanning by: Susie Hamilton

EXHIBIT 3  
DATE 2/11/09  
HB 319



A REPORT  
TO THE  
MONTANA  
LEGISLATURE

PERFORMANCE AUDIT

# *Improving Montana's Opencut Mine Permitting Process*

*Department of  
Environmental Quality*

JUNE 2008

LEGISLATIVE AUDIT  
DIVISION

08P-04

**LEGISLATIVE AUDIT  
COMMITTEE**

**REPRESENTATIVES**

BILL BECK  
BILL GLASER  
BETSY HANDS  
HAL JACOBSON, VICE CHAIR  
JOHN SINRUD  
BILL WILSON

**SENATORS**

JOE BALLYEAT, CHAIR  
GREG BARKUS  
STEVE GALLUS  
DAVE LEWIS  
LYNDA MOSS  
MITCH TROPILA

**AUDIT STAFF**

**PERFORMANCE**

KENT RICE  
KENT WILCOX

**FRAUD HOTLINE  
HELP ELIMINATE FRAUD,  
WASTE, AND ABUSE IN  
STATE GOVERNMENT. CALL  
THE FRAUD HOTLINE AT:**

(STATEWIDE)  
1-800-222-4446  
(IN HELENA)  
444-4446

**PERFORMANCE AUDITS**

Performance audits conducted by the Legislative Audit Division are designed to assess state government operations. From the audit work, a determination is made as to whether agencies and programs are accomplishing their purposes, and whether they can do so with greater efficiency and economy. The audit work is conducted in accordance with audit standards set forth by the United States Government Accountability Office.

Members of the performance audit staff hold degrees in disciplines appropriate to the audit process. Areas of expertise include business and public administration, mathematics, statistics, economics, finance, political science, english, criminal justice, computer science, education, and biology.

Performance audits are performed at the request of the Legislative Audit Committee which is a bicameral and bipartisan standing committee of the Montana Legislature. The committee consists of six members of the Senate and six members of the House of Representatives.

Direct comments or inquiries to:  
Legislative Audit Division  
Room 160, State Capitol  
PO Box 201705  
Helena MT 59620-1705  
(406) 444-3122

Reports can be found in electronic format at:  
[Http://leg.mt.gov/audit](http://leg.mt.gov/audit)

# LEGISLATIVE AUDIT DIVISION

Scott A. Seacat, Legislative Auditor  
Tori Hunthausen,  
Chief Deputy Legislative Auditor



Deputy Legislative Auditors  
James Gillett  
Angie Grove

June 2008

The Legislative Audit Committee  
of the Montana State Legislature:

This is our performance audit of the permitting function of the Opencut Mining Program within the Department of Environmental Quality. Findings and recommendations address a wide range of issues related to how the department permits opencut mines including the timeliness of issuing permits, improving management information, and operating more efficiently.

We wish to express our appreciation to department personnel, as well as stakeholders, for their cooperation and assistance during this audit.

Respectfully submitted,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Scott A. Seacat", written over a horizontal line.

Scott A. Seacat  
Legislative Auditor

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

Figures and Tables .....	iii
Appointed and Administrative Officials .....	iv
Report Summary .....	S-1
<b>CHAPTER I – INTRODUCTION .....</b>	<b>1</b>
Introduction .....	1
Audit Objectives .....	1
Audit Scope and Methodologies .....	1
Data Limitation .....	2
Potential Areas for Future Performance Audit Work .....	2
Report Contents .....	3
<b>CHAPTER II – BACKGROUND .....</b>	<b>5</b>
Introduction .....	5
Opencut Mining Act Governs Opencut Mining Operations .....	5
Types of Materials Extracted from Opencut Mines .....	5
Operators Must Submit an Application Packet .....	5
2007 Legislature Rescinded Application Fees .....	6
Department Reviews Application Information .....	6
State Law Sets Time Frames for Issuing Opencut Mining Permits .....	6
Other Related Permitting Activities .....	8
Other Governmental Entities Can Affect Opencut Permits .....	8
The Montana Environmental Policy Act Applies to Opencut Mines .....	8
Opencut Mining Activity .....	9
Majority of Opencut Mines are Government Owned .....	9
Active Life of Opencut Mines Vary .....	10
Program Funding .....	10
Program FTE .....	10
<b>CHAPTER III – AUDIT CONCLUSIONS .....</b>	<b>11</b>
Introduction .....	11
The Department Does Not Typically Meet Time Frames for Issuing Opencut Permits .....	11
External Factors Can Impact Opencut Mining .....	11
Opencut Mining Act Does Not Address Coordination of Permitting Activities .....	11
The Department Must Comply with the Montana Environmental Policy Act .....	12
Conflicts Exist Between Opencut Mining and Other Land Uses .....	13
Department Has Limited Ability to Deny Opencut Mining Permits .....	15
Local Governments Have Some Authority to Regulate Opencut Mining Operations .....	15
Department Believes Additional Staff are Necessary for Effective Program Operations .....	15
The Department Can Improve Efficiency of Program Operations .....	16

<b>CHAPTER IV – IMPROVING INTERNAL CONTROLS .....</b>	<b>17</b>
Introduction .....	17
Improving File Documentation .....	17
The Department Cannot Demonstrate Compliance with Laws Governing	
Issuance of Opencut Permits .....	18
The Department Does Not Have Internal Controls for Ensuring File	
Documentation is Complete .....	18
Establishing a Formal Application Process .....	18
No Formal Reception Point for Receiving Applications.....	19
Staff Continue to Process Pending Applications.....	19
Limited Use of Letters of Deficiency .....	19
The Department Has Not Established Work Priorities.....	20
Criteria for Processing Applications .....	20
State Law Does Not Set Time Frames for Application Expiration .....	20
The Department's Process Varies from Regulations.....	20
The Program is Examining its Application Process.....	21
Clarifying Staff Responsibilities.....	21
State Law Specifies Department and Operator Responsibilities.....	21
Department Practices Can Impair Staff Independence .....	22
The Department Should Establish Policy and Procedures Clarifying	
Staff Roles in the Application Process.....	22
Facilitating Collection Of The Resource Indemnity And Groundwater	
Assessment Tax .....	23
Not All Permitted Opencut Mining Operators Pay RIGWAT.....	23
The Department Can Assist DOR With Identifying Opencut	
Mining Operators.....	23
Improving the Management Information System .....	24
An Improved Database Would Enhance Management Capabilities.....	24
The Program Should Identify Performance Measures .....	25
<b>CHAPTER V – IMPROVING EFFICIENCY OF PROGRAM OPERATIONS.....</b>	<b>27</b>
Introduction .....	27
Setting Priorities for Processing Opencut Permit Applications.....	27
Ensuring the Public is Notified about the Opencut Permitting Process .....	28
Other Programs Set Notification Requirements .....	28
The Public May Not Be Notified of Proposals for Opencut Mines.....	28
<b>DEPARTMENT RESPONSE .....</b>	<b>A-1</b>
Department of Environmental Quality .....	A-3

## FIGURES AND TABLES

### Figures

Figure 1	Opencut Mine Permit Application Process.....	7
Figure 2	Opencut Mining Sites Proximity to Population Density .....	14

### Tables

Table 1	Opencut Mining Permits Issued .....	9
Table 2	Opencut Mining Program Funding.....	10